Reviewing Committee on the Export of Works of Art and Objects of Cultural Interest, Case 2 (2022-2023) *Self-Portrait as a Knight, with a horse, an easel with painter's palette and a page* by Pier Francesco Mazzucchelli, called 'il Morazzone'

Statement from	Statement of the Expert Adviser to the Secretary of State that
Expert Adviser	the painting meets Waverley criterion three.
	See below
Statement from	Statement from the applicant referencing the three Waverley
the Applicant	criteria against which the Committee will consider whether an
	item referred to it is of national importance.
	a) Is it so closely connected with our history and national
	life that its departure would be a misfortune?
	b) Is it of outstanding aesthetic importance?
	c) Is it of outstanding significance for the study of some
	particular branch of art, learning or history?
	See below
Note of case	See below
	See below
hearing	
Press release	A press release was issued by the Secretary of State on 9 <sup>th</sup>
1 1033 Toloaso	August 2022:
	https://www.gov.uk/government/news/a-painting-by-il-
	morazzone-worth-2-million-at-risk-of-leaving-uk
Recommended	£2,000,000
price	
1 <sup>st</sup> Deferral	8 <sup>th</sup> November 2022
period	
2 <sup>nd</sup> Deferral	n/a
period	
Note of outcome	See below

# RCEWA – Self-Portrait as a Knight, with a horse, an easel with painter's palette and a page by Pier Francesco Mazzucchelli, called 'il Morazzone'

# Statement of the Expert Adviser to the Secretary of State that the painting meets Waverley criterion three.

Please note that images and appendices referenced are not reproduced.

### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

### 1. Brief Description of item(s)

Pier Francesco Mazzucchelli, called 'il Morazzone' (1573–1626)

Self-Portrait as a Knight, with a horse, an easel with painter's palette and a page, about 1605–10 Oil on canvas

78.6 x 59.3 cm

The painting has been recently cleaned and restored. The canvas was lined, perhaps in the late  $19_{th}$  or early  $20_{th}$  century. While the original tacking edges have been lost there is evidence of cusping at top and bottom, and although there is a narrow band of damage along the left vertical edge the overall format seems to be well preserved. Although there are no significant damages, there is evidence of wear in some of the darker areas – in the background, the man's hair, in the darker parts of his face and on his grey cloak – which is not unexpected in a painting of this date.

#### 2. Context

### Provenance:

Diego Felípez de Guzmán y Dávila, 1st Marqués de Leganés (1580–1655), Madrid, by 1642; Recorded in the Leganés collection, in Morata de Tajuña (south-east of Madrid), in 1655;

Collection of the counts of Altamira, Morata de Tajuña, by 1753;

[The picture presumably made its way from Spain to England in the late 18th or early 19th century]; Catherine Brooks (1853–1934), Flitwick Manor, Bedfordshire;

By whom left to her cousin, Robert Adolphus Lyall (1876–1948);

Thence by descent until offered for sale, Bonhams, London, 8 July 2020, lot 312 (as Circle of Gian Lorenzo Bernini), estimate £40-60,000 (withdrawn);

Purchased privately by the present owner.

### Literature:

Alfonso E. Pérez Sánchez, *Pintura italiana del siglo XVII en España*, Madrid 1965, p. 356 (under 'Lost works'):

Jacopo Stoppa, Il Morazzone, Milan 2003, p. 273 (under 'Lost works');

José Juan Pérez Preciado, *El Marqués de Leganés y las artes*, 2 vols, PhD thesis, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 2008, pp. 497-8 (available online at

https://libmma.contentdm.oclc.org/digital/collection/p16028coll4/id/7570);

Alberto Crispo, 'Un autoritratto del Morazzone riemerge dal mercato antiquario; importante aggiunta al catalogo del maestro lombardo', 5 July 2020 (published online at

https://www.aboutartonline.com/un-autoritratto-del-morazzone-riemerge-dal-mercato-antiquario-importante-aggiunta-al-catalogo-del-maestro-lombardo/)

### 3. Waverley Criteria

This is the only known surviving self-portrait by the Lombard baroque painter Pier Francesco Mazzucchelli, also known as 'il Morazzone'. The painting is described in early sources but was

presumed lost, until its appearance on the London art market in 2020: its recent surfacing constitutes a significant rediscovery. Morazzone's name may not be as widely known today as that of his near-contemporary Milanese compatriot Caravaggio, but he played a pivotal role in Lombard painting at the turn of the 17th century. The painting once formed part of the important collection (containing 1,333 paintings) amassed by the Marqués de Leganés, a Spanish politician and military commander who served as Governor of the Duchy of Milan (an area broadly corresponding to present-day Lombardy and parts of Piedmont, Veneto, Tuscany and Emilia-Romagna). The Lombard school of painting is not adequately represented in this country (or indeed outside Lombardy) and, as such, this rare self-portrait by one of its leading protagonists meets **Waverley criterion three**.

### **DETAILED CASE**

### 1. Detailed description of item(s) if more than in Executive Summary, and any comments.

A man in half-length strikes an assertive pose and looks haughtily at the viewer. The heavy grey cloak draped over his shoulder has numerous buttons and buttonholes, implying that he is a man of considerable wealth. He wears stylish leather gloves, painted in swift bold strokes, and we catch a glimpse of a gold chain on his chest. A white lace-trimmed collar offsets his unsmiling face, and his cropped dark hair and curling moustache lend him an arrogant air. His affluence and status are further implied by the elaborately decorated sword pommel glistening at his side. The spirited head of a bridled horse ready to spring into action fills the upper left corner of the composition. Behind the man's (proper) left shoulder we see the head of a page boy, and a painter's palette hung up on a simple wooden easel.

This arresting portrait is the only known self-portrait by the Lombard painter Pier Francesco Mazzucchelli, better known as 'il Morazzone' after the town in which he was born (Morazzone, near Varese, approximately 50km north-west of Milan). Though born in Lombardy, Morazzone spent the first 25 years of his life in Rome: it was there that he saw the city's ancient and Renaissance treasures at firsthand and had the opportunity to study the late mannerist works of contemporaries, such as Ventura Salimbeni and the Cavalier d'Arpino (with whom he may have briefly trained). By 1598 Morazzone had returned to Lombardy, where he went on to become one of the principal painters of the region. In Morazzone's time, the Duchy of Milan was under Spanish Habsburg rule indeed Milan has been described as 'the lynch-pin of Spanish power in Europe'1– and the religious and social climate in Counter Reformation Milan was a powerful influence on the cultural life of the city. In 1602 Morazzone was among the artists chosen (including also Giovanni Battista Crespi, known as 'il Cerano', and Giulio Cesare Procaccini) to contribute to a cycle of 28 vast paintings illustrating scenes from the life of San Carlo Borromeo for the Duomo in Milan, attesting to the high esteem in which he was held by contemporaries.2 He was a prolific draughtsman and is especially known for his religious works; altarpieces and decorative cycles for religious organisations, churches and sacred shrines scattered throughout northern Italy (most famously the Sacromonti di Varallo and Varese). Fewer than 75 paintings are given to Morazzone in Jacopo Stoppa's 2003 monograph, and much of his output remains in northern Italy. No portraits by Morazzone are known, and this is his only surviving self-portrait. i

The painting is recorded in early sources and was presumed lost until its appearance at auction in 2020, where it was correctly identified by the art historian, Alberto Crispo (see *Literature* above). Even though this is the only known self-portrait by Morazzone, his identification is indisputable: the artist's features may be compared to those in an anonymous portrait of Morazzone painting at his easel (location unknown), a partial copy of which is in the Pinacoteca di Brera, Milan.<sub>3</sub>

This painting was once owned by Diego Felípez de Guzmán y Dávila, 1st Marqués de Leganés (1580–1655), in whose collection it is recorded in Madrid in 1642. The Leganés inventory includes dimensions and this, together with a detailed description of the painting's iconography, leaves us in

no doubt that this is the picture to which the inventory refers. 4 Leganés was first cousin to the royal favourite of Philip IV, Count-Duke Olivares, Gaspar de Guzmán (whose surname he adopted from 1627). Leganés spent most of his career away from Madrid on military and ambassadorial duties, first in Catholic Flanders (1630-35) and then in Milan (1635-41). Described by Rubens as 'one of the greatest connoisseurs of this age', Leganés amassed an impressive collection including works by Titian, Rubens, Van Dyck, Raphael and Correggio. 5 Some of these he purchased in Italy, while serving as Captain General and Governor of the Duchy of Milan: this was almost certainly the case for Morazzone's self-portrait, as well as for self-portraits by other Lombard painters (Camillo and Giulio Cesare Procaccini) recorded in his collection. 6 The painting remained in Spain for over a century, which may explain why it later bore an attribution to Pedro Orrente (1580–1645).7

The iconography in this painting is unusual for showing Morazzone as both a painter and a knight – a man skilled in both Painting and War, according to the 17th-century writer Carlo Torre.8

Contemporary biographers Giulio Mancini and Giovanni Baglione both attest to Morazzone's belligerence, referring to his frequent brushes with the law. Mancini goes so far as to describe him as temperamental and conceited ('capriccioso e fiero'), something that is not hard to imagine from the arrogant stance Morazzone assumes in this self-portrait. In giving equal importance to his status as a knight and painter, it has been suggested that Morazzone may have wanted to allude to his being named 'cavaliere' of the Order of Saints Maurice and Lazarus by Carlo Emanuele I, Duke of Savoy (1562–1630). This took place around 1608, when Morazzone was about 35 years old (a reasonable age for the man in this picture), but it would be unusual not to include the order's trefoil Mauritian cross anywhere in the picture. It seems more likely that this self-portrait predates his investiture and represents Morazzone's bid for knighthood.

### 2. Detailed explanation of the outstanding significance of the item(s) under Waverley 3.

This is an exceptionally rare painting and a significant rediscovery, being the only known surviving self-portrait by Morazzone. It is an important addition to the oeuvre of a painter who, alongside Giovanni Battista Crespi (known as 'il Cerano'), Tanzio da Varallo, Camillo Procaccini and his younger brother Giulio Cesare Procaccini, was one of the principal painters in Lombardy at the turn of the 17th century. He is one of the three authors of the celebrated 'quadro delle tre mani' ('the painting by three hands'); a collaborative work by Cerano, G.C. Procaccini and Morazzone showing *The Martyrdom of Saints Rufina and Seconda* (c. 1622-25; Pinacoteca di Brera, Milan).

There are no significant or firmly autograph paintings by Morazzone in any public collection in this country. 10 This cannot be said for il Cerano, Camillo or Giulio Cesare Procaccini, all of whom are represented. 11 As Peter Cannon-Brookes noted in the catalogue accompanying his seminal 1974 exhibition in Birmingham, Lombard Painting of the early Seicento remains a 'relatively little explored field.' 12 Progress in the study of this particular branch of art history has been slow, with monographs on the key painters of the period only emerging over the last 20 years: Cerano (2000), Morazzone (2003) and Procaccini (2020). Given how exceptional it is to find a work by Morazzone outside northern Italy, or indeed how rare it is for one to appear on the international art market, the departure from the UK of this newly discovered self-portrait would amount to a significant loss.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Peter Cannon-Brookes, in *Lombard Paintings c.1595-c.1630: The Age of Federico Borromeo*, exh. cat., Birmingham City Museums & Art Gallery, 1974, p. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Stoppa 2003, pp. 176-7, cats 5 and 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See Stoppa 2003, pp. 270-1, cat. C4, and Crispo 2020, figs 3 and 4. Crispo also draws attention to two other portraits of the artist, in Biella and Milan, Castello Sforzesco, respectively.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See Crispo, *ibid.*, citing the work of J.J. Pérez Preciado (see *Literature*).

<sup>5</sup> Letter dated 27 January 1628, sent from Rubens in Antwerp to Pierre Dupuy in Paris. On the Leganés collection see Mary Crawford Volk, 'New Light on a Seventeenth-Century Collector: The Marquis of Leganés', in *The Art Bulletin*, LXII, 1980, 1, pp. 256-68.

- <sup>6</sup> Giulio Cesare Procaccini's self-portrait is in the Museo Cerralbo, Madrid, inv. 3731.
- <sup>7</sup> See *Provenance* above and Bonhams 2020 catalogue.
- 8 In his Ritratto di Milano diviso in Tre Libri (1674) Torre wrote: 'Pier Francesco Mazzucchelli Milanese Painter, liked weapons very much and delighted in War, but also demonstrated his great prowess [...] with the brush' (1674, p. 46; cited by Stoppa 2003, p. 16). Torre also describes a self-portrait by Morazzone, very similar in iconography to the one in question, in which the artist showed himself clutching the rein of a horse in one hand and paintbrushes in the other, symbols of his dual ability in painting and fighting.
- 9 G. Mancini, *Considerazioni sulla pittura*, c. 1617-21, ed. 1956-7, vol. I, p. 259; G. Baglione, *Le vite de' pittori scultori et architetti...*, 1642, p. 285. Also see Crispo, *ibid*.
- 10 The Holy Family with Angels ('Madonna del Miele') at Kedleston Hall (National Trust, inv. 108858) is listed on National Trust and ArtUK websites as an autograph work, but the picture is a copy after Morazzone's painting in the Galleria Sabauda, Turin, for which a preparatory drawing is at Windsor (Stoppa 2003, pp. 255-7, cat. 72). A monochrome painted sketch in the National Galleries of Scotland, Edinburgh, is tentatively 'attributed to' Morazzone: it was not known to Stoppa, who published numerous variants of the composition in his monograph, including a finer one also *en grisaille* in the Museo del Prado, Madrid (see Stoppa 2003, pp. 185-6, cat. 11).
- 11 Il Cerano's *Flight into Egypt* is in Bristol Museum & Art Gallery; Camillo Procaccini's *Drunkenness of Noah* is in the Hatton Gallery, Newcastle; and nine paintings by Giulio Cesare Procaccini are recorded in British public collections by Hugh Brigstocke and Odette d'Albo in their recent monograph (2020).
- 12 See footnote 1. No less than 13 paintings by Morazzone featured in the exhibition (second only to Giulio Cesare Procaccini's 18).

## RCEWA – Self-Portrait as a Knight, with a horse, an easel with painter's palette and a page by Pier Francesco Mazzucchelli, called 'il Morazzone'

## Applicant's statement

Please note that images and appendices referenced are not reproduced.

We disagree that the painting can be connected in any significant way to the national history of the United Kingdom. Mazzucchelli was an Italian artist with no link with UK during his life. There is no tradition of Morazzone being collected by UK historical collections. The painting was painted in Italy in the early seventeenth century. In terms of the history of collecting the link with the United Kingdom is relatively recent ( XX Century). The oldest documentary evidence records it as being in the home of Catherine Brooks (1853-1934), Flitwick Manor, Bedfordshire, later inherited by her cousin Robert Adolphus Lyall (1876-1948) and subsequently handed down for several generations until it ended up with the second last owner who sold it in June 2020. None of the UK provenance can be considered of any particular relevance. The importance of the painting lies in the fact that it is a great image and very valuable for the art market but under a pure art historical point of view there are numerous examples of this genre (self-portraits) in XVII Century.

It is also a bit surprising that self-portraits of other artist considered much more relevant under an artistic point of view have been exported from UK but Morazzone is now considered to be essential for the English public collections.

Reviewing Committee on the Export of Works of Art and Objects of Cultural Interest, note of case hearing on 8 June 2022: Self-Portrait as a Knight, with a horse, an easel with painter's palette and a page by Pier Francesco Mazzucchelli, called 'il Morazzone' (Case 22, 2021-22)

## **Application**

- 1. The Reviewing Committee on the Export of Works of Art and Objects of Cultural Interest (RCEWA) met on 8 June 2022 to consider an application to export the painting Self-Portrait as a Knight, with a horse, an easel with painter's palette and a page by Pier Francesco Mazzucchelli, called 'il Morazzone'. The value shown on the export licence application was £2,150,000 which represented an agreed sale price. However, this sale was cancelled in advance of the meeting and could not therefore be taken into account in assessing the fair market price of the painting in the event it was found to be a national treasure. There was also a question over the connection of the parties but it was not necessary to investigate this further given this private sale agreement could be discounted from the Committee's deliberations. The applicant explained that they had purchased the painting privately through Bonham's before an article by Alberto Crispo had been published attributing it to the artist as a self portrait. That purchase price was less but it was now worth more with the benefit of the full attribution. They had provided a justification of the £2.15m value by reference to comparables before the meeting and a consignment estimate from an auction house which had not been achieved. At the meeting they provided an independent valuation at £2m with a justification for it from James Mcdonald (formerly head of private sales for the Old Master department at Sotheby's) which was tabled.
- 2. The expert adviser had objected to the export of the painting under the third Waverley criterion on the grounds that its departure from the UK would be a misfortune because (iii) it was of outstanding significance for the study of Lombard painting at the turn of the 17th century.
- 3. All of the regular eight RCEWA members were present and were joined by three independent assessors, acting as temporary members of the Reviewing Committee. The Chairman explained that the binding offers mechanism was applicable for this case.
- 4. All attendees were present in person. n. The applicant confirmed that VAT would not be payable in the event of a UK sale and that the owner understood the circumstances under which an export licence might be refused.

### **Expert's submission**

5. The expert adviser had provided a written submission stating that the painting shows a man in half-length striking an assertive pose and looking haughtily at the viewer. The heavy grey cloak draped over his shoulder has

numerous buttons and buttonholes, implying that he is a man of considerable wealth. He wears stylish leather gloves, painted in swift bold strokes, with a glimpse of a gold chain on his chest. A white lace-trimmed collar offsets his unsmiling face, and his cropped dark hair and curling moustache lend him an arrogant air. His affluence and status are further implied by the elaborately decorated sword pommel glistening at his side. The bridled head of a spirited horse ready to spring into action fills the upper left corner of the composition. Behind the man's (proper) left shoulder we see the head of a page boy, and a painter's palette hung up on a simple wooden easel.

- 6. The iconography in this painting was unusual for showing Morazzone as both a painter and a knight a man skilled in both Painting and War, according to the 17th century writer Carlo Torre. Contemporary biographers Giulio Mancini and Giovanni Baglione both attest to Morazzone's belligerence, referring to his frequent brushes with the law. Mancini goes so far as to describe him as 'temperamental and conceited' ('capriccioso e fiero'), something that is not hard to imagine from the arrogant stance Morazzone assumes in this self-portrait. In giving equal importance to his status as a knight and painter, it has been suggested that Morazzone may have wanted to allude to his being named 'cavaliere' of the Order of Saints Maurice and Lazarus by Carlo Emanuele I, Duke of Savoy (1562–1630), which took place around 1608, when Morazzone was about 35 years old.
- 7. This is the only known surviving self-portrait by the Lombard baroque painter Pier Francesco Mazzucchelli, also known as 'il Morazzone'. The painting was described in early sources but was presumed lost, until its appearance on the London art market in 2020: its recent surfacing constituted a significant rediscovery. Morazzone played a pivotal role in Lombard painting at the turn of the 17th century and there are no significant or firmly autograph paintings by Morazzone in any public collection in this country. As Peter Cannon-Brookes noted in the catalogue accompanying his seminal 1974 exhibition in Birmingham, Lombard Painting of the early Seicento remains a 'relatively little explored field.' Progress in the study of this particular branch of art history has been slow, with monographs on the key painters of the period only emerging over the last 20 years: Cerano (2000), Morazzone (2003) and Procaccini (2020). Given how exceptional it is to find a work by Morazzone outside northern Italy, or indeed how rare it is for one to appear on the international art market, the departure from the UK of this newly discovered self-portrait would amount to a significant loss.

## Applicant's submission

8. The applicant had stated in a written submission that they did not consider that the painting met any of the three Waverley criteria. They disagreed that the painting could be connected in any significant way to the national history of the UK, as Mazzucchelli was an Italian artist with no link with UK during his life. There was no tradition of Morazzone being collected in the UK until relatively recently (20th century). The oldest documentary evidence records it as being in the home of Catherine Brooks (1853-1934), Flitwick Manor, Bedfordshire, later inherited by her cousin Robert Adolphus Lyall (1876-1948) and subsequently

handed down for several generations until it ended up with the second last owner who sold it in June 2020. They did not agree that the UK provenance could be considered of any particular relevance. They further stated that the importance of the painting lied in the fact that it was a great image and very valuable for the art market, but that from a pure art historical point of view there were numerous examples of this genre (17th century self-portraits) in the UK.

### **Discussion by the Committee**

- 9. The expert adviser and applicant retired and the Committee discussed the case. They agreed this was an extraordinary and rare work from an important school of Italian painting notably absent from UK collections and the significance of this being Morazzone's only known self-portrait. As such, they agreed that the painting held importance for research into the social status of painters in 17th century Lombardy. In addition, regarding the painting's provenance, they felt that there was scope for further research which might shed light on the picture's place within British collecting history.
- 10. The Committee then discussed the current value of the painting, and that it had increased substantially since appearing on the market in 2020 due to the reattribution to Mazzuchelli. It had been withdrawn from Bonham's 8<sup>th</sup> July 2020 auction sale in which it had been catalogued as by Circle of Gian Lorenzo Bernini and offered as lot 312 with a pre-sale estimate of £40,000 £60,000. The applicant had confirmed that the re-attribution to Morazzone had not formed part of the private sale negotiations and that the negotiations had concluded a few days before the article by Alberto Crispo had been published. The Committee agreed that a higher value than the 2020 purchase price was appropriate to take account of the re-attribution, the rarity of pictures by Morazzone, the bravura nature of the image and the fact that there were no other known self-portraits by the artist.
- 11. The £2,8m valuation from Sotheby's was an asking price and no evidence had been adduced to substantiate it; the comparables provided by the applicant were not real comparables. It agreed that the valuation with supporting evidence that the applicant had tabled at the meeting referencing the painting's exceptional rarity and distinguished provenance, provided sufficient justification for £2m and it agreed to recommend that as the fair matching price.

## **Waverley Criteria**

12. The Committee voted on whether the painting met the Waverley criteria. Of the 11 members, five voted that it met the second Waverley criterion. 10 members voted that it met the third Waverley criterion. The painting was therefore found to meet the third Waverley criterion for its outstanding significance for the study of Lombard painting during the baroque period.

## **Matching offer**

13. The Committee recommended the sum of £2,000,000 as a fair matching

price.

## **Deferral period**

14. The Committee agreed to recommend to the Secretary of State that the decision on the export licence should be deferred for an initial period of three months. At the end of the first deferral period, if the Arts Council received notification of a serious intention to raise funds with a view to making an offer to purchase the painting, the owner will have a consideration period of 15 Business Days to consider any offer(s). The Committee recommended that there should be a further deferral period of four months that would commence following the signing of an Option Agreement.

## **Communication of findings**

- 15. The expert adviser and the applicant returned. The Chairman notified them of the Committee's decision on its recommendations to the Secretary of State.
- 16. The expert adviser agreed to act as champion if a decision on the licence was deferred by the Secretary of State.

Reviewing Committee on the Export of Works of Art and Objects of Cultural Interest: Note of outcome: Self-Portrait as a Knight, with a horse, an easel with painter's palette and a page by Pier Francesco Mazzucchelli, called 'il Morazzone' (Case 22, 2021-22)

At the end of the initial deferral period, no offer to purchase the painting had been made and we were not aware of any serious intention to raise funds. An export licence was therefore issued.