



Arts Council England response to Fulfilling our Potential: Teaching Excellence, Social Mobility and Student Choice

15 January, 2016

About Arts Council England

Arts Council England's mission is 'great art and culture for everyone'. We work to achieve this by championing, developing and investing in arts and cultural experiences that enrich people's lives, enabling new artistic developments, realising talent, and championing culture in public policy. As the national development agency for the arts, museums and libraries, we support a range of activities from theatre to music, reading to dance, photography to digital art, carnival to crafts. We support and invest in high quality arts practice and the best emerging practitioners whom we believe are the backbone of a dynamic creative economy.

About Arts Council England's relationship with Higher Education

Arts Council England has a strong track record of working with Higher Education Institutions to advance shared agendas and maximise resources. The following list summarises key ways in which Arts Council England currently works with Higher Education Institutions.

- Investing in arts and culture and the provision of cultural resources (which may be integral to an HEI campus)
- Supporting talent development and progression
- Retaining local talent and investing in the locale
- Developing partnerships to feed widening participation targets
- Diversification of the workforce
- Place-based partnerships
- The civic role of HEIs, and shared interests in local authorities
- Research and developing a joint approach to understanding the impact of arts and culture
- Partners in the Creative Economy
- Partners for investment from EU and LEP funding
- Partnership and commissioning of research activity plus joint work on research projects and analysis

The importance of culture in Higher Education

Arts and culture are crucial to imagination, self-expression and creativity. They help develop the skills that fuel the success of the UK's creative industries, and that will result in the next generation of creative talent across the country. As such, it is critical that Higher education institutions recognise the contribution that arts and culture make to their role in developing knowledge, skills and a contribution to place.

UKCES' Working Futures 2012-2022, published in 2014, forecasts a 17.5 percentage point increase in the levels of employment in the creative industries over the ten-year period. More specific figures, for the Arts and Cultural sector are below.

		2012	2017	2022	Change, 2012 - 2022	
					Number	%
Publishing		148,000	161,000	173,000	25,000	17.1
2471	Journalists, newspaper and periodical editors	74,000	81,000	88,000	15,000	19.8
3412	Authors, writers and translators	74,000	80,000	85,000	11,000	14.5
Museums, galleries and libraries		42,000	46,000	50,000	8,000	19.8
2451	Librarians	30,000	33,000	36,000	6,000	19.8
2452	Archivists and curators	12,000	13,000	15,000	2,000	19.8
Music, performing and visual arts		132,000	141,000	151,000	19,000	14.5
3411	Artists	43,000	46,000	49,000	6,000	14.5
3413	Actors, entertainers and presenters	38,000	41,000	44,000	6,000	14.5
3414	Dancers and choreographers	15,000	16,000	17,000	2,000	14.5
3415	Musicians	35,000	38,000	40,000	5,000	14.5

DCMS's Creative Industries: Focus on Employment finds total employment in the Creative Economy in the UK has increased by 5.0 per cent between 2013 and 2014 and by 13.7 per cent since 2011. These increases compare with a 2.1 per cent increase in the total number of jobs in the wider UK economy between 2013 and 2014.

The report also finds that more than half (58.8%) of jobs in the Creative Economy in 2014 were filled by people with at least a degree or equivalent, compared to 31.8 per cent of all jobs in the UK. In 2014 one in every six jobs in the UK held by graduates in 2014 was in the Creative Economy.

These figures indicate the importance of Higher Education to the growing Creative Industries sector and the wider UK economy and the need to match the skills of future graduates with the skills required to support this growth.

Arts Council England's Response to the Government's Green Paper 'Fulfilling our Potential: Teaching Excellence, Social Mobility and Student Choice', November 2015

Public sector equality duty

What are your views on the potential equality impacts of the proposals and other plans in this consultation?

Data on the diversity of the arts and cultural sector (included below for reference) indicates that diversity in the workforce of the sector is below that of the adult working population. We welcome the commitment of the Government to increasing access for students from disadvantaged backgrounds and under-represented groups. We also welcome plans that eligibility for the Teaching Excellence Framework should be contingent on having measures in place to facilitate the access and success of disadvantaged groups.

Arts Council England is concerned that allowing providers to raise fees in line with inflation, there might be a disproportionate impact on those from disadvantaged backgrounds or underrepresented groups.

Arts Council England believes that the projected growth of the Creative Industries offers real opportunity to increase the diversity of the arts and cultural sector. This diversity is, in part, dependent on the diversity of graduates, however. As evidence indicates a prevalence of staff from advantaged socio-economic groups we would

like changes to ensure equality of access for students from lower socio-economic groups.

The Office for National Statistics' 2013 Labour Market report indicates that Undergraduates with degrees in Arts and Humanities have proportionately lower employment rates than other courses and that undergraduates with degrees in Arts and Humanities have some of the lowest gross annual wages.

In the development of criteria and metrics for Teaching Excellence Framework, Arts Council England would like due consideration to be paid to benefits of employment in the arts and cultural sector beyond financial remuneration.

Arts Council England would also welcome acknowledgement of the versatility of degrees in cultural subjects which provide students with skills valued beyond the arts and cultural sector.

We would not want to see a simplified correlation between degree subject and earning potential or degree subject and employment in a directly related field that might further dissuade a student from a disadvantaged background or underrepresented group from choosing to study in these areas.

At a subject level it is interesting to note Equality Impact Assessment findings that the highest representation of disabled students is found in creative arts and design, and that universities with a focus on music and the arts tend to have greater proportions of female students. Arts Council England would welcome inclusion of subject-level detail, particularly in relation to students from protected characteristic groups, in the wider assessment of an institution as part of the Teaching Excellence Framework.

Additional data on the diversity of the arts and cultural sector

Social Mobility

DCMS's Creative Industries: Focus on Employment finds that in 2014, 91.9 per cent of jobs in the Creative Economy were done by people in more advantaged socio-economic groups (NS-SEC 1-4), compared to 66.0 per cent of jobs in the wider UK economy.

Panic! What Happened To Social Mobility In The Arts?- a survey of working life in the cultural and creative industries, recently found that 18.1 per cent of Britain's cultural workforce were brought up by parents who did traditionally working-class jobs (compared to 34.7 per cent in the country as a whole).

Gender

DCMS's Creative Industries: Focus on Employment finds that 36.1 per cent of jobs in the Creative Economy were filled by women. The 2013/14 Annual Population Survey tells us that 50 per cent of the working age population is female.

Ethnicity

DCMS's Creative Industries: Focus on Employment finds that of all jobs in the Creative Economy in 2014, 11.0 per cent were filled by BME workers. The 2013/14 Annual Population Survey tells us that 14 per cent of the working age population are BME.

Disability

Creative Skillset's 2014 Creative Media Workforce Survey found that 5 per cent of people working in creative media industries consider themselves to be disabled. The 2013/14 Annual Population Survey tells us that 18 per cent of the working age population have some form of disability.

Are there any equality impacts that we have not considered?

Arts Council England would welcome greater clarity on practical support available make reasonable adjustments to support study by students from protected characteristic groups.

Continued practical support for disabled students and students with childcare responsibilities, for example, will do much to ensure equality of access. In relation to the TEF, this will be key in ensuring that subjects and institutions that attract particular protected characteristic groups (in the case of arts and culture, female and disabled students), for whom additional support is key, do not incur disproportionate financial responsibility.

Teaching Excellence Framework (TEF)

How can information from the TEF be used to better inform student and employer decision making? Please quantify these benefits as far as you can.

We would welcome the opportunity for the Teaching Excellence Framework to consider sector links within its assessment of exemplary practices. Many Arts Council funded organisations across England are associated with HEIs. Partnership happens in a number of ways, for example: professionals as visiting lecturers; arts and cultural organisations delivering modules within learning programmes; through research and innovation, including through interdisciplinary practice.

Outstanding teaching should cater for differentiated learning styles. Students should be able to make informed decisions in selecting a course of study that will respond to their preferred learning styles.

Arts Council England recommends that Higher Education Institutions are given opportunity to provide information, additional to required metrics, to capture qualitative data about student experience and suitability of teaching. This should be presented, alongside quantitative data to allow students and employers to make decisions based on a comprehensive appraisal of all information available.

Do you agree that the ambition for TEF should be that it is open to all HE providers, all disciplines, all modes of delivery and all levels?

Arts Council England welcomes a consistent approach that will help to ensure that students and employers are able to make informed decisions relative to HE provision. While this consistency is welcome, Arts Council England recommends a degree of sector or subject specific appraisal should be incorporated into the framework. In the case of the arts and cultural sector industry links and skills development are high priority.

Arts Council England also recommends flexibility and space for subject-specific nuance in any metrics proposed to enable Higher Education Institutions to be

dynamic and responsive. Flexibility in this area will allow courses to remain relevant and useful to students and employers.

Any proposed metrics should reward recognition of the need for a range of learning styles and support Higher Education Institutions in developing courses that match sector skill requirements with student experience.

Arts Council England would welcome more information on who will have responsibility for the training and development needs of HE providers, to ensure that all providers, perhaps especially alternative providers, are sufficiently informed and know how to access development opportunities.

Where relevant, should an approved Access Agreement be a pre-requisite for a TEF award? What other mechanism might be used for different types of providers?

Arts Council England supports transparency in relation to higher education institution's access policies.

Access Agreements are valuable in providing students with relevant information and outlining an institution's approach to access. It is difficult to appraise appropriateness of the incorporation of these within the Teaching Excellence Framework without an understanding the degree to which existing Access Agreements will be required to change and whether there will be an expectation that particular targets and milestones should be incorporated and monitored.

Do you agree with the proposed approach to TEF assessments on assessment panels

Through the introduction of assessment panels, we would welcome the opportunity to strengthen and build new relationships between HEIs and professionals in the creative and cultural industries, in respect of enhancing provision at HE and in strengthening partnerships.

Do you agree with the proposed approach to differentiation and award as TEF develops over time?

Assessment at discipline level is welcome. In respect of employment outcomes in arts and culture, the Teaching Excellence Framework should recognise the employment trends of the sector and the associated challenges around social mobility? – see re Panic! within context at start of paper). Arts Council England would welcome space for the framework to develop in line with priorities, opportunities and challenges in the arts and cultural sector.

While Arts Council England welcomes eventual implementation of subject-specific metrics we recognise associated administrative burden and ask that due consideration be given to administrative capacity in the development of additional requirements.

Do you agree with the focus on teaching quality, learning environment, student outcomes and learning gain?

The three outlined aspects appear appropriate. Within teaching quality, in respect of arts and culture, we would welcome an expectation around work-related learning and industry links. The same applies to the learning environment, which should include some delivery within or links to industry settings. Skills and career readiness should include routes to employment, self-employment and business start-up.

Arts Council England asks that the Teaching Excellence Framework recognises a variety of definitions of successful student outcome. An arts graduate setting up micro business might not necessarily command high levels of income but contribution to society and personal wellbeing could be significant.

[Creative Career stories](#), a longitudinal study of the early careers of more than 3,500 creative graduates, found that;

- *Graduates often make a lifestyle choice when they choose a creative education and a creative outlook is already a way of life. After graduation, goals and aspirations remain focused on creative practice*
- *Freelance and short contract work is very common immediately after graduation, and often the only work available. Portfolio careers and self-employment continue to dominate.*
- *Creative graduates are prepared to sacrifice financial reward for the personal satisfaction they derive from creativity. Working to high*

standards, making new work, rising to new challenges, learning new skills, recognition by peers and client satisfaction are important, as well as facilitating creativity in others.

These findings support the need for metrics that reflect different definitions of success. It is also important that the Teaching Excellence Framework gives equal value to portfolio careers and permanent employment.

The Teaching Excellence Framework should focus on measuring the performance of Higher Education Institutions, not promoting one particular teaching style. Design of metrics should include measures to mitigate against the promotion of a particular teaching style not suitable for all subjects.

Do you agree with the proposals to further improve access and success for students from disadvantaged backgrounds and black and minority ethnic (BME) backgrounds?

Arts Council England broadly agrees with proposals to further improve access and success for students from disadvantaged backgrounds and black and minority ethnic (BME) backgrounds but would welcome recognition of the need for practical support to assist study as referenced above.

Do you agree that the Office for Students should have the power to set targets where providers are failing to make progress?

Arts Council England recommends that there is proper opportunity to assess and analyse possible reasons for failure to make progress before targets are set. Any targets should reflect the particular operating environment of the institution in question.

Do you agree with the proposed changes to the higher education architecture?

Arts Council England values the arms-length role currently played by HEFCE, in supporting the relationship between the cultural sector and Higher Education Institutions. These relationships are key in place making, maximising the impact of resources and developing a cultural offer able to attract students. Arts Council England would seek assurance that the role of HEIs as anchor institutions, so crucial in our cities and towns, continues to be supported and valued.

What are the benefits of the REF to your institution and to the wider sector?

Changes in 2014 led to an explicit element within the REF to assess the ‘impact’ arising from excellent research, alongside the ‘outputs’ and ‘environment’ elements. It is now clear the REF has to assess the impact of the research outside of academia i.e. its effect on, change or benefit to the economy, culture, public policy or services, health, the environment or quality of life, beyond academia.

This change has led to beneficial impacts on the arts and cultural sector and Arts Council England (ACE) in the following ways:

In 2015 ACE launched a research grants programme seeking to build our collective knowledge and deepen our understanding of the impact of arts and culture and to promote greater collaboration and co-operation between the arts and cultural sector and research partners. We made it clear the lead applicant should be an arts and/or cultural organisation with significant experience and expertise in delivering arts and cultural programmes. We also stipulated the lead applicant must deliver the activity in partnership with an experienced research partner with suitable professional standards of research quality. This led to a large number of applications from arts and cultural organisations working with Higher Education Institutions submitting high quality research proposals to improve our understanding of the impact of arts and culture on people and society.

We believe the changes to the REF have contributed to HEIs seeking to work more collaboratively with local arts and culture organisations to better demonstrate the impact of their research as described above. The overall benefits to the sector will not only lead to promoting greater collaboration and co-operation between the arts and cultural sector and research partners but also working in partnership, working with others to build and improve the evidence base around the impact of arts and culture.

As the impact assessments in the 2014 REF were developmental, the weighting of impact was reduced from 25 to 20 per cent. In the future we recommend that the weighting should be increased to attribute greater recognition to understanding beneficial impacts of research. This could also lead to HEIs working with more public, private and charitable organisations and local communities.

All case studies should be marked for publication and published on the REF impact case study database.

Do you have any other comments that might aid the consultation process as a whole?

Arts Council England is the development body for English regional museums, with responsibility for effective investment and advocacy for all Accredited museums. Arts Council England recommends that the design of the TEF recognises reflects and rewards the vital role that university museums and collections play in Higher Education.

The role that museums play in collecting contemporary culture is very important: it enables the museums to be relevant to their local population and plays an important part in community cohesion

Many university museums have collections that are designated. Student ability to access excellent collections may lead to a better student academic experience. There is benefit to non-students too. Arts Council England recommends that this type of resource be recognised and supported in assessment of institutions.

Museums and their collections have the opportunity to play an important part in enhancing academic experience and theory. This does not just relate to history subjects. Using geology collections or scientific collections, for instance, can enhance student experience and advancement of academic theory.

University museums supported by the HEFCE Museums, Galleries & Collections Fund

HEFCE-funded university museums care for, and make accessible, a great wealth of collections of national and international significance. They comprise 2.3% of all Accredited museums in England, and 24% of museum collections that are Designated as being of national and international significance. In essence, they constitute a distributed collection of equivalent quality to national museums.

In 2014-15, the £10.5m of HEFCE Museums, Galleries & Collections funding enabled 30 university museums and galleries in England to leverage a total of £42.5m of funding from other external sources (trusts, foundations, research councils, commercial income, philanthropy and donations). In addition, the HEFCE funding leveraged £13.5m of direct support from host universities, giving a total value of £56m of leveraged support at a ratio of over 5:1 to HEFCE funding

During the course of academic year 2014-15, this enabled HEFCE-funded university museums to engage with:

4.5 million visitors
207,000 school students
37,000 university students
16,000 further education students

And, in addition, to:

Hold 222 exhibitions and 4,120 public events
Make available 515 national and 141 international loans of 7,938 museum objects

Sources

¹ http://www.iwm.org.uk/sites/default/files/public-document/IWM_Annual_Report_2014-15.pdf

² http://www.vam.ac.uk/_data/assets/pdf_file/0017/257201/Final-annual-report-2015-v21-signed.pdf

³ http://www.sciencemuseum.org.uk/about_us/smg/corporate/~/_media/897A3761500F41BE8306C8A086697762.ashx

For more information please contact

Marie-Claire Daly
Officer, Policy & Research
marieclaire.daly@artscouncil.org.uk